UNIVERSITY OF
TORONTO
FACULTY OF LAW

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 06102154 9

RESTITUTION

2006 — 2007

Professor E.J. Weinrib

Faculty of Law

University of Toronto

LIBRARY

RESTITUTION

2006 — 2007

Professor E.J. Weinrib

Faculty of Law

University of Toronto

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/restitution00wein_7

Restitution

I. THE NATURE OF RESTITUTION

Aristotle, Nicomachean Ethics, Book Five 1129a26 - 1132b20,
(Ostwald trans.) 1
Corrective Justice in a Nutshell, Ernest J. Weinrib 6
Edwards v. Lee's Administrator, 96 S.W. (2d) 1028 (Ky. C.A., 1936) 13
Vincent v. Lake Erie Transportation Co. (1910), 124 N.W. 222 (Minn. S.C.) 17
Extract from American Restatement of Restitution (1937),
§ 122. Benefits Derived From the Exercise of Incomplete Privilege 20
Palmer, The Law of Restitution, Volume I, 139-140
(Boston and Toronto: Little, Brown, 1978) 22
Foskett v. McKeown [2003] 3 All ER 97 (HL) 23

II. THE DEVELOPMENT OF RESTITUTION

Moses v. MacFerlan (1760), 97 E.R. 676, 2 Burr. 1005 (K.B.) 35
Dobbs, Handbook on the Law of Remedies, (St. Paul: West, 1973) 229 38
Extract from American Restatement of Restitution (1937) 53
Seavey and Scott, Restitution, (1938) 54 Law Quarterly Review 29,
29-32, 36-39 55
Deglman v. Guaranty Trust Co. and Constantineau, [1954] S.C.R. 725;
[1954] 3 D.L.R. 785 59
Pavey & Matthews Proprietary Ltd. v. Paul (1986) 162 C.L.R. 221
(H.C. Australia) 61
Pettkus v. Becker (1980), 117 D.L.R. (3d) 257 (S.C.C.) 66
Peter v. Beblow (1993), 101 D.L.R. (4th) 621 (S.C.C.) 74
Dublin v. Building and Allied Trade Union [1996] 2 ILRM 547 (S.C.) 84

III. UNREQUESTED BENEFITS

1. "One Shines Another's Shoes ..."

Taylor v. Laird (1856), 156 E.R. 1203 91
Ruabon Steamship Co. v. London Assurance, [1990] A.C. 6 (H.L.) 92
Restatement of Restitution - s. 2 96
Birks, An Introduction to the Law of Restitution (1985) 101-103 97
Greenwood v. Bennett, [1973] 1 Q.B. 195 (C.A.) 99
Nicholson v. St. Denis (1975), 8 O.R. (2d) 315 (C.A.) 103
Gidney v. Shank [1995] 5 W.W.R. 385 (Man Q.B.) 107

Gidney v. Shank reversed [1996] 2 W.W.R. 383 (Man C.A.) 113
LAC Minerals Ltd. v. International Corona Resources Ltd. (1987), 44 D.L.R. (4th) 592 (Ont. C.A.); (1989) 61 D.L.R. (4th) 14 (S.C.C.) 115

2. Preserving Another's Property

Nicholson v. Chapman (1793) 126 E.R. 536 (C.P.) 121
Falcke v. Scottish Imperial Insurance Company (1886), 34 Ch. D. 234 123
Great Northern Railway v. Swaffield (1874) L.R. 9 Ex. 132 (Exch.) 128
Prager v. Blatspiel, Stamp and Heacock, [1924] 1 KB 566 (KBD) 131
Jebara v. Ottoman Bank, [1927] 2 KB 254 (C.A.) 133
China Pacific S.A. v. Food Corporation of India (The Winston), [1982] A.C. 939 (H.L.) 134
Restatement of Restitution - s. 117 139

3. Preserving Another's Health

Jenkins v. Tucker (1788) 126 ER 555 (C.P.) 142
Shallcross v. Wright (1850) 50 E.R. 1174 143
Matheson v. Smiley, [1932] 2 D.L.R. 787 (Man. C.A.) 145
Restatement of Restitution - s. 116 147

4. Discharging Another's Liability

Moule v. Garrett (1872), L.R. 7 Ex. 101 (Ex. Chamber) 149
Brooks Wharf & Bull Wharf, Ltd. v. Goodman Bros., [1936] 3 All E.R. 696 (C.A.) 151
Owen v. Tate, [1975] 2 All E.R. 129 (C.A.) 154
Norton v. Haggett (1952), 85 A. 2d 571 (Vt. S.C.) 161
Regional Municipality of Peel v. Her Majesty the Queen in right of Canada (1992), 98 D.L.R. (4th) 140 (S.C.C.) 163

IV. MISTAKEN PAYMENTS

1. The Irrelevance of Fault

Kelly v. Solari (1841), 9 M & W 54, 152 E.R. 24 177
Clark v. Eckroyd (1885), 12 O.A.R. 425 179
R.E. Jones v. Waring and Gillow, [1926] A.C. 670 (H.L.) 182

2. Change of Position

Rural Municipality of Storthoaks v. Mobil Oil Canada Ltd. (1975), 55 D.L.R. (3d) 1 (S.C.C.) 186
Lipkin Gorman v. Karpnale, [1992] 4 All E.R. 512 (H.L.) 188
RBC Dominion Securities Inc. v. Dawson (1994), 111 D.L.R. (4th) 230 (Nfld. C.A.) 200

South Tyneside Metropolitan Borough Council v. Svenska International plc [1995] 1 All E.R. 545 (Q.B.D., Comm. Ct.) 208
Dextra Bank & Trust Co Ltd v Bank of Jamaica, 2002] 1 All ER (Comm) 193 (PC) 1 All ER (Comm) 193 (PC) 215
Cheese v. Thomas [1994] 1 All E.R. 35 (C.A., Civ. Div.) 220

3. Mistake of Law and Invalid Exactions

Hydro Electric Commission of Nepean Twp. v. Ontario Hydro (1982), 132 D.L.R. (3d) 193 (S.C.C.) 226
Air Canada v. British Columbia (1989), 59 D.L.R. (4th) 161 (S.C.C.) 236
Commissioner of State Revenue (Victoria) v. Royal Insurance Australia Ltd. (1994) 182 C.L.R. 51 (H.C. Australia) 246
Kleinwort Benson v. Birmingham City Council [1994] 4 All E.R. 733 (C.A., Civ. Div.) 251
Garland v. Consumers' Gas Co. L.R. (4th) 161 (S.C.C.) 255

V. BENEFITS CONFERRED UNDER COMPULSION

Astley v. Reynolds (1731), 93 E.R. 939 K.B. 266
Skeate v. Beale (1841), 113 E.R. 688 267
Knutson v. The Bourkes Syndicate, [1941] S.C.R. 419 268
Peter Kiewit Sons' Co. of Canada v. Eakins Construction Ltd., [1960] S.C.R. 361 270
Morton Construction Co. Ltd. v. City of Hamilton, [1962] O.R. 154 (C.A.) 275
Smith v. William Charlick Ltd. (1924) 34 C.L.R. 38 (H.C.) 277
Pao On v. Lau Yiu, [1979] 3 All E.R. 65 (P.C.) 280
Universe Tankships Inc. of Monrovia v. International Transport Workers Federation, [1983] A.C. 366 (H.L.) 286
Thorne v. Motor Trade Association, [1937] A.C. 797 (H.L.) 292
CTN Cash and Carry Ltd. v. Gallaher, [1994] 4 All E.R. 714 295
Eadie v. Township of Brantford, [1967] S.C.R. 523 299

VI. RESTITUTION FOR WRONGS

1. Tortious Wrongs

Lamine v. Dorrell (1701), Ld. Ray. 1216 303
United Australia v. Barclays Bank, [1941] A.C. 1 (H.L.) 304
Phillips v. Homfray (1883), 24 Ch. D. 439 310
Strand Electric and Engineering v. Brisford Entertainments, [1952] 2 Q.B. 246 (C.A.) 314
Olwell v. Nye and Nissen, 173 P. 2d 652 (Wash. S.C., 1946) 319

2. Breaches of Fiduciary Obligation

Reading v. Attorney General, [1951] A.C. 507 (H.L.) 322
Attorney-General for Hong Kong v. Reid, [1994] 1 A.C. 324 (P.C.) 327

3. Breaches of Contract

British Motor Trade Association v. Gilbert, [1951] 2 All E.R. (641) Ch.D.) 337
New Orleans v. Firemen's Charitable Association, 9 SO. 486 (La S.C., 1891) 339
Adras Building Materials v. Harlow & Jones, February 11, 1988
(Supreme Court of Israel); [1995] Restitution Law Review 235 340
Attorney General v. Blake [2000] 4 All E.R. 385 (H.L.) 349